



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Microbiology Research Journal
Manuscript Number:	2013_BMRJ_6433
Title of the Manuscript:	Prevalence and Molecular Diversity of <i>Legionella pneumophila</i> in Domestic Hot Water Systems of Private Houses

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The authors have not responded well to any of the previous comments. 1) Although they argue that they have edited the manuscript well, it still contains numerous errors, most, if not all of which were present in the previous version. 2) They have still not provided any statistics in the manuscript. The result is that no conclusions can be drawn. No value is seen in publishing a manuscript that no conclusions can be drawn from. 3) Software use is not sufficient to make these data convincing. 4) RAPD-PCR needs to be defined in the legend since it is an abbreviation and all abbreviations should be defined in the legends. 5) The word sensitized is not correct. Just because a previous reference makes an error, does not mean that it should be continued. Please correct this error.	- As mentioned before the manuscript was sent to Dr Eric R. Dabbs, (A British national and a dear colleague of the authors) working at the School of Molecular and Cell Biology, University of the Witwatersrand, South Africa, for English proofreading, but if the manuscript still contains numerous errors, most, if not all of which were present in the previous version as argued by the reviewer (can the reviewer please point out some of this numerous and how to proceed). - Regarding the statistical analysis in this study, only a small number of <i>L. pneumophila</i> isolates was collected, and even though the isolates were collected from various residential areas in the city of Aqaba still they were all collected from the same type source (meaning water system of apartments or households) and not from different type sources (water system of hospitals, hotels spas, ...etc), these results forced us to use simple statistics as shown expressed only using cross-tabulation as both number and percentage for the categorized data as shown in the manuscript. On the other hand, in other reports for example; Lepeuple et. al. 2004, Leoni et. al. 2005 and Cheng et. al. 2012, the number of isolates was much higher collected from various type sources' water systems (hospitals, hotels spas, ...etc) which made statistical analysis using more advanced statistical methods such as the <i>t</i>-test to compare between the amount of <i>Legionella</i> isolated from various type sources' water systems and report the <i>P</i> values considered to be more significant in their case. The Authors think that this manuscript provided very useful data on the colonization of the plumbing systems of private households located within different residential areas in the city of Aqaba by <i>Legionella</i> spp., This useful data involved: - a- The high tolerance of <i>L. pneumophila</i> isolates to elevated temperature still exists and this tolerance enhances their capacity towards colonizing the water heating system. - b- The results of the genotyping showed that there is a high degree of heterogeneity among <i>L. pneumophila</i> collected from water heaters set at temperature ranging between 25-60°C. This finding may suggest a relation between the genotypes and the tolerance of the <i>L. pneumophila</i> isolates recovered in this study to elevated temperature. - c- In contradiction to previous reports, our results showed an increase in the colonization of the plumbing systems with <i>L. pneumophila</i> serogroup1 rather that serogroup2-14 as reported previously. - d- Also In contradiction to previous reports water samples collected from all newly established residential areas within Aqaba city tested negative for the presence of <i>Legionella</i>.



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

	There for we believe that the work done in this manuscript should be viewed with concern and hopefully that its publication will open the door towards continuous monitoring through similar surveillance studies conducted to include other cities and other water systems and further try to develop an international legislation and prevention measures to aid in reducing the Legionella related pneumonia cases in future work. - Regarding the insufficiency of the software the authors would like to mention that this software has proven its credibility and has been used in a lot of published paper, with similar goals like ours: - a- Baddley JW, Pappas PG, Smith AC, Moser SA. Epidemiology of <i>Aspergillus terreus</i> at a university hospital. J Clin Microbiol. 2003 Dec;41(12):5525-9. - b- Rocha BA, Negro GM, Yamamoto L, Souza MV, Precioso AR, Okay TS. Identification and differentiation of Candida species from pediatric patients by random amplified polymorphic DNA. Rev Soc Bras Med Trop. 2008 Jan-Feb;41(1):1-5. - Figure and table legends were revised and all abbreviations were defined as suggested by the reviewer and highlighted in yellow inside the manuscript. - The word sensitized was corrected to” linked to” line 98 as suggested by the reviewer and highlighted in yellow inside the manuscript.
--	--